A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF SPARKOL VIDEOSCRIBE MEDIA IN TEACHING WRITING SKILL

Dwi Almatiana[1], Desi Sri Astuti[2], Yulia Ramadhiyanti[3]

[123]IKIP PGRI Pontianak, dwialma67@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The research aimed to investigate the contribution of using sparkol videoscribe media in teaching writing skill. This research reviewed the previous studies on sparkol videoscribe in teaching writing skill which were published within the past ten years. This research used systematic review as the method. The population of this research was eighteen studies, then it screened used flow charts based on inclusion and exclusion criteria. There were five studies as the sample. This research used indirect observation as a technique and document analysis as the tools. To analyze the data, this research used thematic analysis as the technique analysis of data. Based on the result of the review, the result indicated that (1) The use of sparkol videoscribe media helped the teacher in teaching writing skill. (2) The successful of using sparkol videoscribe media in teaching writing skill based on students' achievement increased. (3) Sparkol videoscribe media encouraged students' interest, motivation, activeness, and able to engage students' attention. From the results above, the sparkol videoscribe media gave the contribution in teaching writing skill.

Keywords: Systematic review, sparkol videoscribe, writing skill.

INTRODUCTION

Writing is one of the skill that should be mastered by students. By writing, students can learn grammar, enrich vocabulary, and express their ideas. Writing is important to be mastered because by writing the students will get knowledge such as vocabulary, grammar, and punctuation. With writing, the students are also involved in the language they use, so that they can learn more about the language.

Writing is one of the productive language skills that might be a complex problem for all students. Writing is called as a complex skill because it requires other elements, such as grammar, spelling, and punctuation. In teaching writing, it needs to use learning media because it can be defined as various components of the learning environment that help students to learn (Asyhar, 2012:7). One of the learning media is video. According to Herdianti (2017:124), video is the media that interesting and comfortable, one of them is sparkol videoscribe.

Sparkol videoscribe is an animated video learning medium consisting of a series of images arranged into a whole video. By using video, it offers the power of creation. Joyce and B. White (2015) in Fakhriyani (2018:26) state that sparkol videoscribe is great for creating short whiteboard-style animations to explain certain concepts, either by instructor

or student. It means videoscribe is a software that creates whiteboard animation to explain and understand the material because videoscribe can be made by teachers and students.

Scribing is a perfect medium for stories (Air *et al*., 2015:7). They also say that if the audience is young people, who can feel disconnected in a standard classroom, to keep them engaged is using a videoscribe because it is considered relevant and reliable in improving the educational processes of thinking, teaching, learning, and leading in the era of digital knowledge.

Sparkol videoscribe is a software for making whiteboard animation. As stated by Lindsay (2015:83), videoscribe is one small way to do that, by helping untrained people to make eye-catching and memorable videos. It means, videoscribe can help people creating an interesting video. Sparkol videoscribe is one of the video forms, media with the concept of a whiteboard using hand drawings and as if drawing or write on the board. Sparkol videoscribe can be presented in words, cartoons, and pictures form. According to Rasul *et al*. (2011:78), audiovisual aids are important in the education system. Audiovisual aids are those devices that are used in classrooms to encourage the teaching-learning process and make it easier and interesting. They also said that audiovisual aids are the best tool for making teaching effective. Likewise sparkol videoscribe which is audiovisual form, with its unique characteristics, sparkol videoscribe can present learning content by combining pictures, sounds, and attractive designs, then students are able to enjoy the learning process.

The researcher found some researches that used sparkol videoscribe as learning media which diverse views of the use of sparkol videoscribe. Therefore, the researcher used systematic review as the method to extract information in some studies that used sparkol videoscribe in teaching writing skill that can be synthesized. The systematic review is research to identify, selecting, assessing, and synthesize the relevant studies. By using a systematic review, the data would be merged and analyzed. Besides, the researcher would have a deeper understanding of the media that used in teaching writing skill. It is also useful for the future researchers in order to they can consider whether this media can be used as learning media in teaching writing skill.

Based on the background, the researcher considered that necessary to conduct the research with the title "A Systematic Review of Sparkol Videoscribe in Teaching Writing Skill".

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The method of this study is a systematic review. Systematic review is a process of identifying, assessing, and interpreting all available research evidence, to provide answers for a particular research question (Siswanto, 2010:14). The procedure to conduct this research consist of five steps (Cronin *et al.,*2008:39), they were selecting a review topic, searching and selecting the studies, analyzing and synthesizing the studies, organization of writing the review, and references.

The population in this research was eighteen studies. It was screened based on inclusion and exclusion criteria. The inclusion criteria were the studies were published between 2010 and 2020, must be written in the English language, must have an abstract, English subject, and focused on writing skill. If the studies did not fulfill the inclusion criteria, it should be excluded. Based on the screening that has done, the researcher got five studies as the sample.

The research used purposeful sampling, indirect observation was the technique of data collection and the tools were document analysis. The researcher used thematic analysis to analyze the data.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
Results

In analyzing the studies, the researcher made a code, categories, and theme manually. Each study would be presented in different discussions appropriate with the level of student education. This section focused on the theme that formed in each study and also to answer the research question: *"How do sparkol videoscribe media contribute in teaching writing skill?"*. Some of the studies investigated more than one education sector, there were primary, intermediate, secondary, and university. The majority of studies investigated writing skill in primary (1 study, conference paper), intermediate (1 study, journal), secondary (2 studies, article, and thesis), and university (1 study, thesis). Most of the studies were conducted from 2012 to 2018.

The Development of Sparkol Videoscribe Based Internet Learning Media in Improving Writing Skills of Indonesian Language for Elementary School Students

The researchers conducted the design through four steps, they were defining step, designing step, developing step, and learning media development. Before applying

videoscribe media, the researchers checked the validity of media and material. From the result of validity, sparkol videoscribe-based internet learning worth to be used, and the result was good.

The teaching and learning process of the students' activities were successful. The score of students' average was higher from the indicator. The students could acquire the lesson material. Indirectly, the videoscribe was able to present the material. The teacher activity in the teaching-learning activity is considered to be successful when the percentage increased.

There were two teachers that pointed as the observer for the trial test of the developed media. The result of the teacher's response was very good and it meant the teacher gave their positive responses to the developed media. It indicated that the use of sparkol videoscribe was not only got the response of students but also the teachers gave their positive responses about this media.

In the post-test, there were only a few students who did not pass the writing class. Meanwhile, the majority of students who got score higher passed the writing class. The result of the students' responses, they were happy with the developed media, so it could get a positive response from the students. Ultimately, from the data above that the scores the development of sparkol videoscribe-based internet learning gave a very good validity. So, the development of media worth to be used and was good.

Development of Learning Media Based on VideoScribe to Improve Writing Skill for Descriptive Text of English Language Study at Seventh-grade students of MTs At Taminiyah

The study review indicated that before implementing sparkol videoscribe, the researchers gathered the students' problems. Its function to know what the students' problem and how the solution. After gathering the data, the researchers found that the students had not mastered English writing skill competently. Writing also not a preferred thing because students experience difficulties in writing essays well, like pouring the idea into writing. Other problems were low mastery of vocabulary which result in an appropriate selection and the use of words. It also found that more than half of the sample made mistakes in writing English spelling. Those problems made the students' achievement was low in writing assignment.

Knowing the problem of students was an important thing because by knowing the problem, also know how to solve it. Therefore, the researchers selected the media based on students' problems. Before implementing the media, the researchers checked the validity of the product by learning material experts, learning media experts, and learning design expert. The researchers also prepared the tools for measuring students' improvement, it consisted of the questionnaire for students' responses and validation by experts, observation sheets, and performance tests.

In applying the media, the researchers needed other tools like a projector and a computer. Videoscribe could not be used without a projector and laptop. It was because the subject that watches the video was not only one or two persons. During the teaching and learning process, the researchers stopped the video, its purpose to allow the students to ask the question. In applying the media, it did not mean that the students will watch the video a whole time, the researchers could stop the video to have interaction with the students. After the video finished, the researchers gave the exercises to the students.

In the learning process, the students were more active and more enthusiastic. The researchers have also invited two observers who observed during the learning process in the class. This was important to invite the other observer to prove the real situation while videoscribe was applied.

Based on the comparison of the result of students' response questionnaires to learning media, on the whole that there was an increase in value from individual trials and field trials which have increased with very positive categories. From the result, the learning media was getting closer to the perfect stage and could be used in the learning process.

Besides the response of learning media, there was an increase in the ability to write a descriptive text. With the medium context and images, it can help students to learn and avoid their bored. The researchers used pre-test and post-test to know the comparison without and using sparkol videoscribe. The result of the pre-test was with good enough category. After using videoscribe, the result of the posttest increased in a good category. Based on the result of the pre-test and post-test, the researcher also conducted a paired sample t-test where the result was Ho is rejected and Ha is accepted. From the result, it can be concluded that there were differences between before and after using sparkol videoscribe media.

The Use of Sparkol Videoscribe to Increase Students' Interest in Studying English for the XII Graders of Komputer Jaringan Department SMK Negeri 2 Wonosari in Academic Year 2016 / 2017

This research aimed to find out the effect of using sparkol videoscribe in English teaching and learning included students' interest and students' achievement. It because students had a learning problem, such as lack of vocabulary, lack of self-confidence in practicing English, less interest, lack of motivation, and how the teacher taught was boring for students. Therefore, the researcher search for the appropriate media in solving this problem.

In this study, the researcher did not involve in making videoscribe media, but the students that would make it. There were sixteen students of XII KKJ involved in creating videoscribe. There were three topics included asking for attention, application letter, and caption.

For the first step, students were asked to make a group. The topic to be discussed was asking for attention. Then, the researcher delivered an explanation first about how to install and how to use the application. After all students understand how to use the application, then they started to create it and would present it in the topics of asking for attention in front of the class. This was not only for asking for attention topics but also application letters and captions where the researcher asked the students to make a group.

Although the students have heard the explanation of how to create videoscribe, they also have other problems. For example, some students were still having problems in the searching matter about asking for attention, because of the lack of internet at home, some of them did not have a computer or netbook, and they had many home other assignments. Some students also wrote their problems during the process of making videoscribe, especially related to layout, content, and the use of English to present the result in front of the class.But, it was found that most of the students had a problem with the layout. Meanwhile, some of them had difficulties in searching for content to be written into videoscribe. They stated that they had difficulties in creating and matching font size and the pictures and also moving pictures for every slide.

Behind their difficulties, the students also have their opinion towards videoscribe media. Based on the researcher's observation, all seemed to be interested and had high enthusiasm for trying this application. This was showed by using sparkol videoscribe, English class became more interesting and enjoyable for students. All the XII KJ

students stated that the use of sparkol videoscribe made the English class more interesting, it was not boring, and it could motivate students more to learn the topic. It was found that the majority of the students said that English class was more enjoyable, they could be more creative and innovative by using sparkol. They also stated that they became more interested and courageous to study English and a few students stated no opinion about this media.

To reinforce students' understanding and skills about the topic, the teacher or the researcher gave a task to make a video related to the topic. The researcher distributed some questionnaires and reflection forms to understand more about students' opinions related to the use of sparkol videosribe in English class. The result showed that by using sparkol videoscribe, it was more interesting and enjoyable, students stated more reinforcement is needed, development of the application is needed, and some of them stated to increase cooperative group works. From all videos gathered, it was found that all students were skill full in the topic of asking for attention. From the score results toward the video, it was found that the average scores were no students' scores below the minimum criteria. The students were also given a home assignment to write an application letter and identify parts of the letter. The results showed that the average score has already passed the minimum criteria in the class. They were also given an individual assignment to make a caption and the results show that the average score also increased.

The Effect of Whiteboard Animation toward Writing Ability and Students' Motivation at SMK Al-Ishlah Palangka Raya

To know the problems of students, the researcher conducted free observation and a free interview with the English teacher. Based on the interview, the teacher said that the students were difficult to make writing assignments. The students also have less motivation, when teacher make interaction by speaking English, they just laugh and answered yes or no. Besides, the teacher also said that the students always said that they were confused about how to start the writing. Therefore, the researcher conducted a pre-test to know their achievement before using learning media.

In the pre-test of the experiment group, there were most of the students got a very low score. In the control group, the result of the pre-test was most of the students got a very low score. After implementing the media, the students (experimental group) were

taught using whiteboard animation video got a higher score than students who were taught without whiteboard animation video which means it improved. Then, the students (control group) got a higher score than without whiteboard animation. The students who were taught using whiteboard animation videos got high motivation than students who were taught without whiteboard animation video. Nevertheless, some students were still careless in using verbs in the past form. They often wrote some verbs in the present form. Some students often also did not have any idea to improve their descriptive theme. These problems were found in the first and second meetings

But all the weaknesses, the result of the data analysis concluded that there was a significant effect of using whiteboard animation toward writing ability and motivation.

Using Online Video Scribed Animation to Teach Writing Self-regulation at Students enrolled in CIS*2050*DE during the summer 2011 semester at the University of Guelph

The research was conducted because there was an increase in online learning as well as the use of video instruction. Besides, the popularity of videoscribe was also increasing, but there has been no research on whether self-regulation strategies can be taught through the use of videos or not.

Study review indicated that the students' responses were the video educational and entertaining, they also said how impressive the quality of the video. Besides it, some students also said that the video was informative and entertaining. It made them can do their task more efficiently and easily. Talk about the design, they also said that videoscribe was a novelty of the presentation style. Not only a positive response, but a few students also said that the video was too speed so that they could not catch what the content in the video. The students also felt bored when the video was too long especially in the introduction part.

When students asked about the effect of the video, they said that the video improved the quality of their blog, video effect on blog quality for the results, and also the fact that most students found the video improved the quality of their next blog is encouraging. But, video duration also affects students. Some students indicated that the video was at least somewhat too long. They at least somewhat agreed that the video sustained their attention. This implies that even the people that thought the video was too long still found it useful. Some of the students' responses about the video were somewhat too long, somewhat agree that the video sustained their attention, too long, neutral it

being too short, and disagree that the video was too short, disagree that the video was too long. In conclusion, the majority of students indicated that the video was too long.

When using the learning media, one of the purposes was to catch the attention of students to get understanding. An important factor in motivating students to learn is the ability of a teacher to both catch and maintain students' attention. By using video, it was easier to catch a student's attention. Results showed that the majority of students at least somewhat agreed that the video both caught and sustained their attention. But, all of the students that reported they disagreed that the video caught their attention because they did not ever pay full attention to the video. They also reported either somewhat disagree, neutral, or somewhat agree that their attention was sustained. Some of the students whose attention was not at least somewhat sustained. It seems as though these people simply did not pay much attention to the video. They all reported that they did not find the video entertaining, and only a few of them said the blog somewhat improved their blog

In the teaching and learning process, students have their opinion about sparkol videoscribe. They found the video and the majority of the students reported that they found it at least somewhat entertaining. But, some students did not perceive the video as at least somewhat entertaining and some of them reported that they did not watch the video even once with their full attention.

Besides the responses of students, the researcher wanted to know how engage the video while watching the video, students also have their opinion about the video engaging. The majority of the students watched the video at least once with their full attention, of the students that watched the video multiple times. Although a higher percentage of these students gave the video their full attention. During videoscribe media is applying, students have each activity when watching. When watching, students used a checklist, asked the question, and took note. From these activities, when watching the video, the students not only focused on the video, but they have the other tools to understand the material. It was also affected their blog writing.

In fact, the students not always enjoy the video than the checklist. It proved with their reason for not watching the video for some reason. They said that busy, not interested, and already satisfying with the checklist, where the checklist has helped them to write. They also said that they have no time to watch the video. However, the researcher focused on the use of videoscribe media in teaching writing skill where

checklist as the additional tools in written form to guide the students in writing. The researcher compared the comparison that watch the video and did not watch the video. Some students that watched the video, the majority of students filled in the pre-survey question about the grade they were striving for on their next blog. From some students that didn't watch the video, just a few students did not fill in that question. Results showed no significant difference between the grades being strived. This is an interesting finding, but possibly due to the small sample size, it is not significant.

However, the ability of videoscribe media also can be seen from the result where the students that watched the video would be more self-regulated after watching the video. The results showed that there was a significant increase in self-regulation and also in their goal-setting, which is a part of personal self-regulation, and these results show a trend that students outlined more after watching the video. In conclusion, the result indicated that there was a statistically significant increase in students' self-regulation and environmental goals. Students also find the video entertaining, educational, interesting and retain their attention.

Discussion

In this discussion, the researcher discussed the result of the review. There were five studies have been reviewed by the researcher by using thematic analysis, where the researcher create codes in each study that relate to the research question and made it become categories. Then, from the categories, the researcher made the themes to be displayed in this research.

The results of the reviews that have been conducted, there are several similarities and differences between one study and another. First, from studies using R&D methods, namely from the primary and intermediate levels. They used the Thiagarajan 4D model or what is commonly called the Four-D model. Second, the students' problem similarity before implementing the media, namely from the secondary level (2016 & 2018), and intermediate. The average problems of students at school are lack of vocabulary, writing spelling, grammar, did not how to start the writing, pouring ideas into writing, lack of motivation, and lack of confidence. As stated by Wigati (2014:56) that the students have difficulty expressing their ideas in English caused by a lack of vocabulary and inability of writing with the correct grammar. Besides, several studies have differences from other studies, namely from secondary (2016) and university level. At the secondary level, the

researcher asked the students to make videoscribe media, while in another study, the videoscribe media was created by the researcher himself and implemented to the students. It is different from university, at the university level, the way of teaching and implementing the media is not in the classroom or at school, but rather an online course. Researchers also have barriers in implementing the videoscribe media, because the situation there is summer, which is the time for work and vacation. The courses at this time are also not as many as those offered at other times, therefore researchers want to make videos as attractive and interesting as possible by involving several video lectures and animation by video clerks.

In this review, there were some important findings in some studies that have been reviewed. The result of data analysis showed that sparkol videoscribe media gave a contribution in teaching writing skill. It proved from the result of each study, where the score has increased. This review indicated that at the secondary level (2016), videoscribe media can motivate the students to learn, English class was more interesting, not boring, enjoyable, the students could be more creative and innovative. Videoscribe also can increase students' achievement. It is supported by Sessu *et al.,* (2018:28) who said that videocribe can motivate students and also teach the language that is useful, make a class more interesting. It means that videoscribe could be comforting learning media. Same as the secondary level (2018) found that whiteboard animation affected students' writing ability and motivation.

The intermediate level also found that the students were more active and more enthusiastic in carrying out using videoscribe also there was an increase in students' ability in writing. It is supported by Sarifah and Ulfa (2020:23) that when the story in slide, students more enthusiastic to join the learning process.

Followed by the primary level that found that the students acquired the lesson by using videoscribe media and they were happy. The result showed that there was a significant increase in pre-test and post-test results. As stated by Jaworska and Hernik (2018:508) that enjoyment and happiness have a positive effect on learning. It happened to the primary level where the students enjoyed learning using videoscribe media. Athena and Kiptiyah (2018) also stated that learning by using sparkol videoscribe more creative and motivated in learning English, especially in basic learners.

As the researcher explained in the finding section that at the university one of the obstacles was implementing remote videoscribe in the summer, where students had other

activities, but the results were very encouraging. Students said that video was informative, educational, entertaining, sustained their attention, catch and maintain students' attention. The result showed that there were statistically significant increases in students' environmental self-regulation and goal setting. As stated by Air *et al*., (2015:6) that videoscribe can engage a viral audience. Callahan (2017) also stated that videoscribe is particularly effective at holding the viewer's attention. As David's story in Air *et al*., (2015:10), he made an attractive scribe video to explain the ideas in his book. His video helped him engage new audiences.

From the findings above, it meant that sparkol videoscribe media gave the contribution in teaching writing skill. Even though it could help the process of teaching writing skill, there were some problems with it. It proved from students' responses and observations by the researchers in each study. These problems would be integrated from some studies.

Some important problems in some findings in the studies were when the students involved directly in creating videoscribe. The students had limited access like the internet, did not have supporting tools such as laptops or netbooks. According to Sessu *et al*., (2018:28) that the researcher must log into a sparkol account in order to access videscribe, which means must have an internet connection. Based on this problem, it needed to do the observation before deciding to use this media. The researcher needed to observe whether the supporting tools enable to use of this media or not.

On the other side, the researcher also reviewed the duration of video length. One study discussed the length of the video and some of the students did not watch it because the video was too long. Based on the review of the researcher the length of the video also became a problem, because when the video was too long, it engaged students' bored. One of the characteristics of videoscribe animation is to reduced length. As stated by Bonk (2008) that the video needs to be short. He also described that based on his research, short videos of 1 to 4 minutes are ideal.

Besides it, the speed of videoscribe also affects the students' understanding, therefore it should be set. As stated by Sessu *et al*., (2018:28) that the user cannot slow the video down to make it easier for students to understand what they have been taught.

The other problem also found that students' problems in first and second writing, where some students did not pay attention to their tense, and they did not have the idea to improve their descriptive theme.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

Conclusion

The researcher founds the studies by using a search engine, those were google scholar, research gate, seameo seamolec. The search strategy yields eighteen studies. Those studies were chosen based on inclusion and exclusion criteria. It was screened and from the result of screening, it would be reviewed, then the researcher got five studies that fulfill the criteria. To reviewed the studies, the researcher used thematic analysis. The researcher created codes, categories, and themes in each study because each study had a different level of education.

Based on the review, the use of sparkol videoscribe was successful in students' achievement, students more active and enthusiastic, got the new experience, high motivation, and can engage students' attention. Therefore, the findings of this review that the use of videoscribe in primary until university helped the teacher in teaching writing skill, can increase students' achievement, students' interest, motivation, activeness, and able to engage students' attention. In conclusion, sparkol videoscribe contributed in teaching writing skill.

Suggestion

Based on the studies had been reviewed, the researcher suggests the future researcher that to observe students' supporting tools if the teacher involves them to create the video. The teacher also considers whether the area to teach serves the supporting tools like the projector. Besides, the teacher must set the time of video duration. If the video is too long, the worrying thing is the students will be bored and not give their full attention. It makes the teacher cannot explain or give the material perfectly.

The future researchers that want to use this media, also pay attention to students' tense. Therefore, although sparkol videoscribe as the media in teaching writing skill, the teacher must explain to make the material clear. It means that the media cannot work by itself, the teacher must explain the material too with the aid of sparkol videoscribe.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Air, J., Oakland, E., and Walters, C. (2015). *The Secret of Behind the Rise of Video Scribing*. Bristol: Sparkol Books

Asyhar, R. (2012). *Kreatif Mengembangkan Media Pembelajaran*. Jakarta: Referensi Jakarta.

Athena, T., and Kiptiyah, M. (2018). The Effect of Sparkol Videoscribe as Media in Presenting the English Material. *Jurnal Pendidikan Seni, Bahasa, dan Budaya, Vol 1(2)*

Bonk, C. J. (2008, March). YouTube anchors and enders: The use of shared online video content as a macrocontext for learning. *Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association (AERA)*, Annual Meeting, New York.

Callahan, E. (2017). The Application of Animated Whiteboard Videos in Teaching Concepts from The Urantia Book On Social Media. *Foundation Education Seminar "Giving the Truth of Heaven: Using Our Talents,* Urantia: March 23-26, 1-12

Fakhriyani, L. (2018). *Media Development of Learning Based Video Scribe on Social Science Subject at Class 8th of Junior High School Wahid Hasyim Malang.* A Thesis of Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim

Hardianti and Asri, K.W. (2017). Keefektifan Penggunaan Media Video dalam Keterampilan Menulis Karangan Sederhana Bahasa Jerman Siswa Kelas Xii Ipa Sma Negeri 11 Makassar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Asing dan Sastra*, Vol 1(2): 123-130

Jaworska, E. and Hernik, J. (2018). The Effect of Enjoyment of Learning. *Conference: 12th International Technology, Education and Development Conference,* Poland: 1st May 2019, 508-514

Lindsay, F. (2015). *The Seven Pillars of Storytelling*. Bristol: Sparkol Book

Rasul, S., Bukhsh, Q., and Batool, S. (2011). A Study to Analyze the Effectiveness of Audio Visual Aids in Teaching Learning Process at University Level. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 78-81

Sarifah, R., and Ulfa, M.S. (2020). The Effectiveness of Videoscribe as Innovative Media to Increase Students Reading Comprehension. *English Teaching Journal: A Journal of English Literature, Linguistics, and Education, Vol 8(1): 19-24*

Sessu, A., Sahlan., and Laepe, A. (2018). The Effectiveness Of Video Scribe In Teaching English At SMPN 1 Molawe Konawe Utara. *Journal of Language Education and Educational Technology,* Vol 3(1): 89-99

Siswanto, S. (2010). Systematic Review Sebagai Metode Penelitian Untuk Mensintesis Hasil-Hasil Penelitian (Sebuah Pengantar). Jurnal Buletin Penelitian Sistem Kesehatan, Vol 13 (4): 326–333

Vianita, I.N. (2018). *The Effect of Whiteboard Animation toward Writing Ability and Student's Motivation at SMK Al-Ishlah Palangkaraya*. A Thesis of State Islamic Institute of Palangkaraya

Wigati, F.A. (2014). Kesulitan Pada Aspek-aspek Writing Mahasiswa dengan English Proficiency Level yang Berbeda. *Jurnal Ilmiah Solusi*, Vol 1(3): 46-61